Assessment Result Oriented Performance Appraisal Practices in Ethiopia

(The case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch)

Thomas Haile (Assistant Professor), *Sileshi Worku (MBA) and Betilehem Mekuria (MBA)*

Abstract

This research was designed to assess result oriented performance appraisal in the case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch. In addition the study attempt to address three specific objectives; to identify the major problem toward result oriented performance appraisal, to identify the methods used for evaluate result oriented performance appraisal, and to describe the benefits of result oriented performance appraisal in the case organization. The study used descriptive research design. The researcher used both primary and secondary sources, primary data were collected through questionnaire and structured interview. In order to select the respondents, the study used census method from employees' and data were obtained from all 25 respondents and from top level mangers the required data collected using interview questionnaire personally. The researcher used both quantitative and qualitative methods to describe the results. The finding of the study reveals that the major performance appraisal problems are; un fair evaluation, discrimination based on some factor, failed to consider all task of employees preformed, elevate all in one direction and failed to give employees feedback on time are some of the problems. In addition, the main methods used for performance appraisal are questionnaire, work standard, evaluating committee and subordinates. And finally, the result of performance appraisal is used to reward employees, salary increment, promotion and moral incentives, and it will help the office to accomplishing their task in good manner. The researcher recommends, that the office should create awareness to employees about result oriented performance appraisal, the human resource department should provide effective training program to the supervisor in order to improve the result appraisal skills. Adama Ethio-telecom should develop objective oriented training needs assessment to have a continuous training for better out results based management.

Key word: *Performance Appraisal, Effectiveness and Efficiency*

Introduction

Performance appraisal is the process of determining and communicating to an employee how he or she is performing on the job as establishing a plan of improvement. When properly conducted performance appraisal not only employees know how well they are performing but also influence their future level of effort and task directions (Bayars, 2009).

The history of performance appraisal is quite brief. Its roots in the early 20th c can be traced to Taylors pioneering time and motion studies. But this is not very helpful. For the same may be said about almost every thing's in the field of modern human resource management. As a distinct and formal management procedure used in the evaluation of work performance, appraisal really dates from the time of second world wars not more than 60 years ago. It begins as simple methods of income justification (http// www.perfomance appraisal.com, access date December 8, 2018 @ 12:10).
Result oriented performance appraisal system is method of performance appraisal that used to evaluate employees based on their task performed. It promotes adverse, high performance work force by implanting and maintaining effective management. Its main objective is to measure employees based on what they achieved (www.apps.gov/human capital/standard, access date December 8, 2018 @ 12:10).
Different organizations used result oriented performance appraisal to evaluate employees' performance. But according to some employees suggestion there have been problems regarding to result oriented performance appraisal. So this study was assessing those problems in in the case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch.

In any organization one of the ways to enhance organizational performance is positively influence the labor component of productivity. Result oriented performance appraisal is one way of influencing employees to achieve organizational goals. It creates motivation on employees and increases organizational productivity. Providing feedback to the employees with aim of motivating that person to eliminate performance deficiencies (Desler, 1999). Although result oriented performance appraisal has the above purpose some employees believed that some public enterprise have problems regarding the result oriented performance appraisal. Ethio-telecom Adama Branch is one of the organization, from the result of the information that the researcher obtained informally problems, such as unfair evaluation and some evaluation errors like evaluate all subordinate on one dimension, evaluating employees on most recent work performance, discrimination based on personal characteristics and using high or low rating.

According to Workie, (2000) refers general lack of knowledge; experience and skill, rating employees based on an overall impression resulting from one or few incident bad or good, rating influenced by the most recent behavior, allowing past performance appraisal ratings to unjustly influence current rating, refers in-effectiveness in observing and documenting performance and vagueness of criteria and standards of performance are some of the problems. Other common problems that occur with appraisal include lack of regular feedback instead of taking difficult issues at the right time feedback is stored and given in piece at appraisal time, it is often view as tedious routine and inadequately trained appraisal. From the recommendation part of previous researcher the problem is critical issue, therefore this study were tried to conduct further investigation toward result oriented performance appraisal in the case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch.

General objective

The general objective of the study is to assess result oriented performance in the case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch.

Significance of the study

The proposed study have the following significances for different parties; it will be used as reference for other researchers who intend to further investigation in a similar title, it also helps managers of the case organization and other similar organizations to recognize the factors affecting result oriented performance appraisal and take corrective measures to improve the problems related with the investigated title.

Research Methodology

Since the main objective of the study was to assess the problems related to result oriented performance appraisal in the case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch, descriptive research design were used. Through this method, the current result oriented performance appraisal system of Ethio-telecom were deeply studied and findings were qualitatively described, since the study focus on result oriented performance appraisal method most likely the qualitative description were better to discuss the issue. In addition, quantitative methods were used to describe the data collected by using questioner method and the analysis were presented in the form of tables, percentage, graph and charts.The researchers were used both primary and secondary data sources for accomplishment of the study. Primary source were collected from employees' of the office and secondary source of data were gathered from research articles, books, the internet, the organizational manual and other related documents.

To collect the primary data the researchers were three types of data collection instruments, i.e. questioner, document review and interview. The researchers used questionnaire (both open ended and close ended) the close ended questions were prepared in the form of multiple choice and respondents are expected to choose among the given alternatives, in addition open ended questions was given to respondents to explain their subjective judgment about the issue and for the purpose of most frequently needed information about pertinent to the topic. In addition, the researcher were used interview question to collect data from top level managers and HR head in the form of verbal response in order to collect data about result oriented performance appraisal system in the organization and to cross check employees response to top level mangers; and document review in HR department were done to obtain reliable and valid information. The researchers were used census survey to collect data from employees' because the number of employees *in the case of Ethio-telecom Adama Branch* is small in number, which accounts 25 employees. So, in order to increase the reliability of the data the researchers were utilized census method.

DISCUSSIONS AND RESULTS

Table 1 Understanding of Employees about Result Oriented Performance Appraisal

Item	Alternatives	Respondent	
		No	*Percent*
Understanding of Employees about result oriented performance	Very high	3	12%
	High	10	40%
	Moderate	8	32%
	Low	3	12%
	Very low	1	4%
	Total	*25*	*100%*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

As we can see from table 4.3 implies that understand of employees and officials on result oriented performance appraisal among 25 respondents 3 (12%) have very high understanding, 10 (40%) have high understanding, 8 (32%) have moderate understanding, 3 (12%) have low understanding and the remaining 1 (4%) have very low understanding about result oriented performance appraisal. Generally, we can conclude that the majority of employees have high understanding about result oriented performance appraisal.

Table 2 Employee's Attitude toward Result Oriented Performance Appraisal

Item	Alternatives	Respondents	
		No	*Percent*
Employee's attitude toward result oriented performance appraisal	Very high	3	12
	High	10	40
	Moderate	8	32
	Low	3	12
	Very low	1	4
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

The above table indicated the attitude of employees toward result oriented performance appraisal, 3 (12%) of the respondent replied they have very high attitude towards the evaluation, 10 (40%) of the respondent have high attitude, 8 (32%) have moderate attitude, 3(12%) have low attitude and the remains, 1 (4%) have very low attitude. The above information implies that most employs have good attitude toward result oriented performance appraisal, but not all employees have good attitude.

Table 3 the Criteria used to Evaluate Employees in Ethio-telecom

Item	Alternatives	Respondents	
		No.	*Percent*
The criteria used to evaluate employees in Ethio-telecom	Quality of work	3	12
	Quantity of work	7	28
	Experience in the work	7	28
	Knowledge and skill	8	32
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

As we can infer the above table that about the criteria that Ethio-telecom used to evaluate employees, according to the survey out of 25 employees majority 32% of respondents said the criteria that Ethio-telecom used to evaluate performance of employees is knowledge and skill.

In addition an equal number of respondents which accounts 28% replied that Ethio-telecom used quality of work and experience are the criteria's which used to evaluate employees in Ethio telecom. A small number of respondents said

that the organization use quality of work as a criteria by Ethio-telecom to evaluate its employees' which accounts 12% of the total respondents. According to the above table it is possible to conclude that Ethio-telecom uses knowledge and skill to evaluate its employees in addition the office used experience in work and quality of work to evaluate its employees.

Table 4 Employee's Participation in the Organization Regarding the Appraisal

Item	*Alternatives*	*Respondent*	
		No	*Percent*
Do you participation in the appraisal	Yes	15	60
	No	10	40
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

From the above table we can infer about employees parturition in the appraisal process among the total respondents 15 (60%) of respondent said that they participated in the appraisal process, whereas 10 (40%) didn't participate in the appraisal process. This implies that the organization didn't give equal participation to all employees event it relatively incorporate majority of employees. Therefore, the organization should have to give equal participation to all employees.

Table 5 Shows Employees expect if there is no Evaluation in Ethio-telecom

Item	*Alternatives*	*Respondents*	
		No.	*Percent*
Shows employees expect if there is no evaluation in Ethio-telecom	Lack of commitment towards job	4	16
	Reduce productivity of employees	4	16
	Incompetence with others	17	68
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

The above table indicates that from the total respondents who were asked 17 (68%) respond that absence of performance appraisal results incompetence with others, 4 (16%) replied that employee who respond lack of commitment towards a job and reduce productivity. From this we can conclude that all of the respondent are aware of the problem that could exist if there is no performance appraisal especially incompetence with others, so there should be a good performance appraisal system.

Table 6 Method of Performance Appraisal System

Item	*Alternatives*	*Respondent*	
		No.	*Percent*
Method of performance appraisal system	Man to man comparison	2	8
	Grading method on a given level of out put	4	16
	Evaluate based on performing different tasks	15	60
	others specify	4	16
	Total	25	100

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

Table 6 shows that from the total respondents who were asked 2 (8%) respond that man to man comparison method is applied by the office, 4 (16%) responded and that grading method, whereas 15 (60%) replied appraisal by the task performed (MBO) and the remaining 4(16%)specified others like:- peer appraisal, rating committee, self-ratings and appraisal by subordinates. From these we can conclude that most of the respondents replied that the method of appraisal used by Ethio-telecom mainly depend on the rules and regulations of the organization.

Table 7 the Appraisal Method that Ethio telecom used

Item	Alternatives	Respondent	
		No.	*Percent*
The appraisal method that Ethio telecom used	Questioner	4	16%
	Work standard	10	40%
	Evaluating committee	5	20%
	Subordinates	6	24%
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

As we can see from the above table that the organization depends mainly on work standard (based on employees output or achievement) which accounts 10 (40%) respondents of the total respondents. In addition of this Ethio-telecom also used questionnaires which accounts 4 (16%) of the total respondents, 6 (24%) of respondents said that their evaluation is based on subordinates and the reaming 5 (20%) respondents replied their evaluation is according to evaluating committee. So, based on the above table it is possible to conclude that Ethio-telecom Adama branch used highly work standard followed by subordinates to rate its employees.

Table 8 What Employees get if they carry out their task properly

Item	Alternatives	Respondents	
		No	*Percent*
What employees get if they carry out their task properly	Salary increment	4	16
	Promotion	7	28
	Moral incentive	10	40
	Others specify	*4*	*16*
	Total	25	100

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

In table 8 employees were asked about how employees get if they carry out their task properly. From the total respondent 4 (16%) replied that they carry out their job properly and they receive salary incentives, 7(28%) replied that they will get promotion from their organization. But majority of respondents responded that they will get moral incentive which accounts 10(40%) and the remaining 4(16%) specified others like:-recognition, reward, bonus on their basic salary and the like. Based on the above data when employees carried out their task properly the organization provided them a moral incentives, promotion and salary increment respectively.

Table 9 Problems of Result Oriented Performance Appraisal

Item	Alternatives	Respondents	
		No	*Percent*
Problems of result oriented performance appraisal	Discrimination	14	56
	Evaluate based on most recent performance	9	36
	Evaluate all in one direction	2	8
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

Table 9 indicated what problem is existed in Ethio-telecom related with the implementation of result oriented performance appraisal. Form the total respondents 14 (56%) replied there is rater discrimination in the performance

appraisal system, 9 (36%) said that the organization evaluate its employees based on most recent performance and 2 (8%) replied the organization evaluate all in one direction.

Generally, from the above table respondents feedback it is possible to conclude that Ethio-telecom Adama branch is exposed to discrimination in applying result oriented performance appraisal.

Table 10 Reasons for problems identified

Item	Alternatives	Respondents	
		No	*Percent*
Reasons for problems identified	System design problem	5	20
	Raters problem	13	52
	Problem from employees	3	12
	other specify	*4*	*16*
	Total	25	100

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

Table 10 shows the reason for problems in Ethio-telecom. According to respondents opinion 6 (20%) said that the main reason for the problem are system design problems, 13(52%) of respondents replied raters problem, and the remaining 3 (12%) of respondent replied problem from employees and the remaining 4(16%) specified others like:- hallo effect, bias and licensor strictness. From the above data we can conclude that in the organization rater's problem are intensified and the most reason for evaluation problem. In addition to this system design problems and problems from employees are the major source of evaluation problems.

Table 11 Employees' feedback about problems in Ethio-telecom

Item	Alternatives	Respondents	
		No	**Percent**
Is there any problem at the time of implementing result oriented performance appraisal	Yes	15	60
	No	10	40
	Total	*25*	*100*

Source: Own Questioner, 2019

From the above table we can conclude that majority 15 (60%) of the respondents responded that there have been problems in the case organization at the time of implementing result oriented performance appraisal but 10 (40%) responded that there is not any problem in the organization. The problems which the majority mentioned were; disagreement, failed to consider all tasks of employees performed, carless evaluation and raters biasness are among the problems.

Result of Interview questions to the top level management

According interview made with (Habtamu,2019) General Manager of Ethio- telecom Adama Branch the following interview Questions were analyses.

1. What are the methods used to evaluate employees in your organization?
There is a criteria used by our office to evaluate employees performance and it is used for different purpose like for promotion, chance for education, transfer from one branch to another branches, and other incentive methods. Actually, the evaluation program is done in different bases. Sometimes it is done monthly, quarterly, semi-annually and in annual bases. When the head office has a special plan for incentive and promotion we could evaluate our employees monthly, quarterly, or semi-annually. But most of the time there is annual performance measure program.

2.How do you explain the feeling of your employees towards the evaluation method?
It could be difficult to explain employees feeling regarding the performance evaluation result. Because, some employees are happy and some others complain about the performance result. The office give the responsibility for each department head to evaluate its members, and it is impossible to get a perfect result from all of them. So in

some departments there is complain regarding the performance appraisal result and some others accept it. Generally it depends on the raters' personality about how to treat employees, regarding performance evaluation.

3. Please explain about the implementation of result oriented performance appraisal system?

As researchers have mentioned previously the implementation of result oriented performance appraisal is not perfect. It depends on the raters' personality. But regarding with the criteria our office used a good evaluation criteria and mostly employees agree about the criteria used to assess their performance the problem is raters view about their employees, and sometimes in order to give much benefit for a few employees department heads could do favor for selected employees, that makes employees angry and they will apply for complain and the HR department and sometimes I intervene to solve the problem. Generally, the implementation of the program is good.

4. What Problems are faced at the time of Implementing Performance Appraisal?

Employees complain against raters, and sometimes when the result of the performance measures need the HR department could loss the data. When it is needed for promotion or transfer employees start to complain about their result. Actually the problem is not only on the side of the raters; it is on the raters, employees and the HR department. Most of the time employees don't worry about their result when it is documented but when the office used it for incentive and promotion as criteria they start to complain about the past performance result.

5. How the management was solved the problems related with performance appraisal faced in your organization?

As researchers have mentioned above the office faced different types of problems and in order to solve these problems the office use different approaches according to the source of the problem. Basically the office tried its best by announcing employees to follow up the performance result as soon as they rated, the rates also announced to strictly adhere rules and regulation and they have to be free from bias when they evaluate their employees, and if there is complain on the side of employees they are expected to announce it as much as fast, in addition the office has prepared a form when employees are given their result and accept it to sign it. Unless to complain to the HR as soon as fast. Finally, the HR department is expected to document properly.

Conclusion

Based on the findings of the data the following conclusion are analyzed

- Understanding of employees and officials on result oriented performance appraisal are relatively good.
- In Ethio-telecom most employees have good attitude towards result oriented performance appraisal.
- In the organization various criteria that used to evaluate result oriented performance appraises are quality of work, Quantity of work experience with work and knowledge and skill of work. But according to the data analyzed, the organization mostly depends on knowledge and skill of work.
- The absence of performance appraisal causes lack of commitment toward a job reduces productivity of employees and incompetence with others. So the existence of performance appraisal helps employees to understand problem existed areas.
- The method of performance appraisal system that Ethio-telecom used to evaluate employees is man to man comparison, grading method and appraisal by the task performed. But the organization was mostly depends on appraisal by the task performed i.e. Ethio-telecom sets an objective or give a task to the employees and measures those tasks how the employees preformed.
- The employees are evaluated by using questionnaire, work standard, evaluating committee and subordinates. Work standard and questionnaire are the main tools of evaluating. Before measuring the employee directly the evaluator distributes the questionnaire his employees and after getting the questionnaire every employee put his or her opinion, suggestion and his dissatisfaction on the given questionnaire and he or she summit the form to the supervisor or the manager. At the end the mangers reads the suggestion and the comment given on the format carefully and also measure his or her task performed at the same time and compare their task relative to the objective.
- In the cause organization the rewards for employees were accomplishing their task in good manner and salary increment promotion and moral incentives, but most employees get moral incentive for the accomplishment of their task in good manner.
- There have been many problems in the cause organization among those problems some are unfair evaluation, discrimination based on some factor, failed to consider all task of employees preformed, elevate all in one direction and failed to give employees feedback on time are some of the problems. Among these problems discrimination is the most one. There was also poor reward system un-willingness of employees and biasness.

The causes of the above problems are system design problems, raters' problem and problem from employees. Raters' problems are the most significance one in Ethio-telecom BibugnWoreda branch.

5.3. Recommendations

, What researchers want to recommend to here is that the management should give great emphasis and attentions for performance appraisal. Because performance appraisal have many benefits for the employees and the Ethio-telecom. Among such benefits it increase productivity increase motivation on employees, and it provides better rewards for employees who perform his/her job effectively and efficiently.

, To change the employees' attitude towards result oriented performance appraisal Ethio-telecom should create awareness to employees, give enough reward who perform their task effectively and give a chance to express their feeling and opinion about the evolution. The management should also needs effective implementation of result oriented performance appraisal. Because only effective implementation of appraisals leads employees to improve their performance otherwise instead of being a base for productivity, it would be a case of grievance with in employees.

, The human resource department should provide effective training program to the supervisor in order to improve the result appraisal skills. The training used to reduce rating errors such as bias, discrimination, error in interpretation etc. the training also used the rater to have good relation with subordinates. Generally training helps the rater to display a sense of fairness and justice when dealing employees performance appraisal.

, Making employees active participating is the homework of the organization; the parallel communication which creates mutual understanding between supervisors and subordinates. The rater must encourage subordinates to express their ideas and opinions and keep himself well informed about his subordinates' accomplishment.

, Ethio-telecom should develop objective oriented training needs assessment to have a continuous training for better out results based management. The performance appraisal should be used as a source of such information that would selectively identify the unique training needs and match them with the specific employees to be training. Rewards are the human resource element that should be regarded to the employees to heighten their market which is function of the high expected output.

, As conclusion to the objective that was analyzing the main purpose of performance appraisal system in Ethio-telecom adama branch it is important to know that employees must be totally involved in the development of the system to decrease the source problems.

Reference

- BantieWerkie (2000), Introduction to management, Addis Ababa Commercial College and institute of development, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Dessler Gray (2003), Human Resource management 9th edition, India.
- Edwin B.Flippo (1984) personnel management 6th edition, fong and son's printer pteSingapore
- Workie, 2000). human resource and personnel management, Addis Ababa university, Ethiopia
- K.aswathappa (1997) human resource and personnel management,3th edition .tatamc Graw-hill publishing co. ltd. India
- Ahmed, (2010). human resource and personnel management,London,3rd ed.

- (Www.performanceapparisal.com) access date December 8, 2018 @ 12:10
- (Www.apps.gov/humancapital/stadard) access date December 8, 2018 @ 12:10

Acknowledgement