

THE INFLUENCE OF PHYSICAL EVIDENCE, PEOPLE AND PROCESS AS ELEMENTS OF MARKETING MIX ON PATIENT SATISFACTION

Mulja Munadjat¹, Muhardi², Nurdin³, Nunung Nurhayati⁴, Dadang Kusnadi⁵, Titik Respati⁶

¹ Magister of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Islam Bandung, Indonesia

² Magister of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Islam Bandung, Indonesia

³ Magister of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Islam Bandung, Indonesia

⁴ Department of Accounting, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Islam Bandung, Indonesia

⁵ Magister of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Islam Bandung, Indonesia

⁶ Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Islam Bandung Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Within the framework of healthcare management, patient satisfaction assumes a central role as a critical indicator of service excellence, necessitating comprehensive examinations of the interplay between physical evidence, personnel, and processes within the context of the marketing mix. This current research study is focused on delving into the intricacies of the Haemodialysis Unit at the Cicalengka Regional Hospital, situated in the Bandung Regency. By employing a meticulously crafted combination of the descriptive verification method and the analytical power of multiple regression analysis, a comprehensive questionnaire was disseminated among a specific cohort of 50 patients availing services from the hemodialysis unit during the month of June 2023. The ensuing results underscore the profound impact of the triad of process, personnel, and physical evidence on patient satisfaction. Notably, the process element emerged as the most potent driver, wielding an influential impact at 32.8%, closely followed by the personnel component at 10.2%, and the physical evidence factor at 6.75%. Cumulatively, these elements collectively contribute to a substantial 90.5% of patient satisfaction, highlighting their indispensable role in the continuous pursuit of elevated standards of service provision within the healthcare domain.

Keyword: *Physical Evidence, People, Process, Patient's Satisfaction*

1. INTRODUCTION

Healthy living is a basic human need and is also one of the main elements (indicators) of a prosperous living standard. Health services continue to develop in various parts of the world, both in developing and developed countries [1]. There have been a number of influences on health care over the past few years and most of them continue to play a role into the 21st century. Some of the main developments that have influenced this change are in the face of unprecedented competition in which health care providers are forced to know customer profiles and be able to determine their needs [2], [3].

In contemporary business landscapes, the dynamics of competition have transcended the conventional pursuit of market share, emphasizing instead the imperative quest for opportunity share. Shedding light on this transformative trend, Othman [4] echoes the insights of Helms [5], who underscore two critical reasons contributing to the potential downfall of business entities in the competitive arena. Firstly, numerous organizations grapple with the challenge of disentangling themselves from historical precedents, thus inhibiting their ability to shed archaic paradigms and embrace contemporary business strategies. Secondly, an inability to envision and shape the future trajectory, coined

as 'inventing the future,' delineates the essence of a collective learning process that seamlessly integrates exceptionally unique and distinctive core competencies, both within and across organizational boundaries [6]. This latter aspect assumes paramount importance in the pursuit of opportunity share. Analogously, within the realm of health services, particularly in the domain of hospital healthcare, the contemporary landscape is witnessing a shift from market share competition to opportunity share competition, exemplified by the innovative utilization of radiotherapy services.

This legal framework underscores the imperative for hospitals to establish comprehensive service benchmarks, ensuring the consistent attainment of excellence across all facets of their operations, while concurrently upholding a pivotal societal role in catering to the needs of the community, as underscored within the statutory mandate. Elucidating this stance, Article 2 of Law No. 44 of 2009 delineates that "Hospitals are structured upon the foundation of Pancasila principles and are grounded in the values of humanity, ethics, and professionalism, advocating for the principles of equitable benefits, justice, the safeguarding of equal rights, and the eradication of all forms of discrimination. Furthermore, these institutions are dedicated to ensuring fairness, patient protection, and safety, all while actively embracing their societal obligation."

The notion of the social function embodies a concerted health service initiative that prioritizes community welfare above commercial gains, centered upon a deeply ingrained sense of humanitarianism. The contemporary evolution in the perception of hospitals' social function stems from their identification as referral service institutions, marked by their capital-intensive and labor-intensive nature. Initially, the hospital enterprise was conceived as a compassionate venture dedicated to assisting individuals grappling with adversity or infirmity. Over time, this concept has transitioned from a purely social enterprise to a hybrid model, encompassing both socio-business and non-profit business paradigms, and eventually gravitating towards profit-centric approaches [7]. Presently, the proliferation of hospitals in diverse regions across Indonesia, including Bandung Regency, can be attributed not only to the necessity of catering to the escalating demand but also to bridge the gap in the provision of hospital beds relative to the population. Moreover, hospitals serve as agents of a burgeoning trend aimed at enhancing the overall quality of life and public health within their respective communities.

As a Regional Public Service Agency (BLUD), the Cicalengka Regional General Hospital is compelled to orchestrate an incremental and methodical elevation of its operational revenue during each fiscal cycle. Consequently, it becomes imperative for the Cicalengka Regional General Hospital to meticulously devise an optimal strategy that perpetuates the steady garnering of customer trust, thereby ensuring the sustained delivery of exceptional healthcare services. A pivotal facet of this strategy entails the seamless provision of superior, quality, and competitive Hemodialysis (HD) services within the hospital's purview, all the while upholding a steadfast commitment to operational effectiveness and efficiency.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

As the health sector increasingly assumes the attributes of an industry, hospitals are compelled to engage in functional business operations within their management structures, including the imperative task of cultivating high-quality service products [8]. Yet, within the sphere of hospital healthcare, it is essential to discern the appropriate marketing mix phenomenon, facilitating the proactive direction of services to engender enhanced patient satisfaction. Marketing, in this context, represents a holistic process that encompasses the generation of consumer demand and its sustained fulfillment [9]. The marketing mix, on the other hand, serves as a collection of strategic tools deployed to realize specific marketing objectives within the target market [10]. As expounded by Kotler [11], the conventional marketing mix framework revolves around the 4Ps, namely Product, Price, Place, and Promotion, with the Product serving as the fundamental entry point into the market, necessitating careful attention and consideration of consumer needs and product quality [12]. Furthermore, the element of Price assumes significant importance subsequent to product quality, with its influence pivotal in the consumer decision-making process. Complementing these, the dimensions of Promotion and Place contribute to the comprehensive marketing strategy. In the domain of service marketing, the marketing mix necessitates expansion through the incorporation of non-traditional elements, encapsulated within the 3P model, consisting of Physical Evidence, People, and Process.

The process dimension embodies the strategic implementation of streamlined protocols within a company's framework, tailored to curtail potential pitfalls during the consumer service cycle, including considerations of service velocity and seamless service delivery [13]. Complementing this, the facet of physical evidence entails the meticulous design of corporate infrastructure, aimed at fostering consumer engagement and piquing consumer interest, ranging from architectural aesthetics to the strategic placement of equipment and the professional presentation of staff attire [2]. Equally vital, the people component delineates the pivotal role of employees in shaping the consumer experience, emphasizing the paramount importance of cultivating a customer-centric workforce culture characterized by well-trained, motivated, and incentivized personnel (Schein, 2010). This

involves comprehensive training initiatives, motivation schemes, rewards systems, and educational programs aimed at nurturing human resources in alignment with the noble pursuits of education, striving to foster individuals of integrity and noble character [14].

Patient satisfaction stands as a pivotal metric demanding meticulous consideration within the realm of health services. Defined by the Indonesian Dictionary as a sense of contentment, happiness, or relief, satisfaction epitomizes an individual's emotional response derived from the consumption of a product or service, reflecting their overall experience. In essence, satisfaction manifests as the equilibrium between the perceived performance of a product or service and the corresponding expectations of the consumer. Notably, when product performance falls short of expectations, customers are left disenchanted, while meeting expectations yields a sense of satisfaction. Exceeding expectations, however, results in a heightened degree of customer gratification [11]. In line with this, researches articulate customer satisfaction as an appraisal of one's emotional response post a comparative evaluation of the perceived performance against their initial expectations [15], [16].

Patient satisfaction is intricately shaped by the patient's evaluation of the healthcare services they receive within a hospital environment, juxtaposed against their preconceived expectations of the said services [11]. Consequently, the level of patient satisfaction within a hospital hinge upon the efficacy of the services rendered. However, it is often observed that the provided services occasionally fail to align precisely with the patients' preferences, leading to a notable discrepancy between the actual service delivery and the anticipated standards of care. Elaborating on this notion, research result elucidates patient satisfaction as an intricate interplay between the patient's expectations, which are inherently shaped by the interactions with healthcare professionals, and the resultant performance of the healthcare services administered during the course of the treatment process [17].

3. RESEARCH METHOD

This research employs a descriptive verification method, which serves as a comprehensive approach to illuminating significant relationships between the variables under investigation, thereby enabling the formulation of precise conclusions that elucidate the intricacies of the subject under scrutiny. The application of descriptive analysis facilitates the comprehensive comprehension of both independent and dependent variables through the systematic organization and tabulation of data, subsequently explicated through an elucidation of frequency and percentage distributions, thereby facilitating the categorization of the variables. Concurrently, the verification analysis assumes a crucial role in this process by empirically testing the formulated hypotheses, particularly delving into the discernible impact of the marketing mix elements, such as physical evidence, personnel, and process, on the overarching construct of patient satisfaction within the context of the hemodialysis unit at the Cicalengka Regional General Hospital. The employed inclusion criteria in this research are; patients in the hemodialysis unit who have undergone a minimum of two follow-up visits at the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital; patients in the hemodialysis unit who are capable of effective communication; and patients in the hemodialysis unit who are willing to participate in the research. For sample determination in this study, the researcher will utilize all patients visiting the hemodialysis unit (a saturated sample). Primary data in this research is obtained through questionnaires distributed directly to the respondents.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The comprehensive descriptive analysis of the key research variables, including Physical Evidence, People, Process, and Patient Satisfaction, provided a holistic understanding of the dynamics shaping the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency. The intricate nature of this examination aimed to unearth the underlying factors contributing to patient satisfaction and gauge the hospital's performance against pre-defined standards.

A significant aspect of the analysis revolved around the responsiveness of the administrative and registration personnel, as well as the conduct of doctors, nurses, and pharmacy/laboratory staff. The observed trends within these domains illuminated the effectiveness of the hospital's internal processes and highlighted the crucial role played by the human elements in delivering quality healthcare services. The discernible patterns suggested a generally favorable environment in terms of patient-staff interactions, emphasizing the importance of effective communication and professional conduct in fostering a positive patient experience.

Furthermore, the analysis shed light on the effectiveness of the Process within the Haemodialysis Unit, uncovering critical insights into the intricacies of service delivery and patient management. The substantial actual score obtained from the respondents' feedback reinforced the notion of a well-structured and efficient operational framework within the unit, indicative of a proactive approach in streamlining patient procedures and optimizing service delivery.

In essence, the study's comprehensive exploration and meticulous analysis illuminated the multidimensional nature of patient satisfaction, underscoring the significance of both tangible and intangible factors in shaping the overall healthcare experience. Through its nuanced approach and insightful findings, the study laid the groundwork for further enhancements in service delivery and patient care strategies within the healthcare facility, with implications for broader improvements in the healthcare management domain.

The study initiated its exploration by meticulously analyzing the profiles of the respondents and thoroughly examining the reliability of the instruments employed. Subsequently, the research delved into a comprehensive descriptive analysis of the key research variables, namely Physical Evidence, People, Process, and Patient Satisfaction, which form the crucial components of the intricate healthcare service environment within the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency. Additionally, employing a robust multiple regression analysis, the study aimed to elucidate the precise impact of Physical Evidence, People, and Process on the critical aspect of Patient Satisfaction in the same medical unit.

Notably, the research took into account the entire population of registered patients, comprising a substantial cohort of 50 individuals receiving treatment within the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency. Data analysis in this extensive study revealed that the patient evaluations, as measured through correlation values (r -table), demonstrated a noteworthy superiority over the critical value (0.2787). Consequently, each question pertaining to the variables under scrutiny was deemed both valid and reliable, thereby providing a comprehensive and detailed understanding of the hospital's operations and patient experience.

Furthermore, an in-depth analysis of the responsiveness of the hospital's administrative and registration personnel unveiled significant insights into the functioning of the unit. Most notably, the high percentage of responses falling within the 'suitable' category indicated a considerable degree of satisfaction among the respondents. Similar patterns emerged in the evaluation of the conduct of doctors, nurses, as well as pharmacy and laboratory personnel, with each category exhibiting a noteworthy level of competence and performance.

Moreover, the culmination of the study provided a comprehensive perspective on the effectiveness of the Process within the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency. The total actual score obtained from the respondents' feedback, amounting to 1003 and representing a significant 66.9% of the ideal score, underscored the commendable performance of the hospital in ensuring an efficient and effective patient journey, further consolidating its position within the 'good' category.

5. CONCLUSIONS

After analyzing the data and discussing the influence of physical evidence, people, and process on patient satisfaction in the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency, the following conclusions can be drawn: According to the respondents, the variable of physical evidence, people, process, and patient satisfaction fall into the 'good' category, indicating the patients' agreement that the hospital has comprehensive and modern healthcare facilities, decent services, and responsiveness. Regarding the partial influence of the elements of the marketing mix on patient satisfaction in Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency, the study revealed that:

- Partially, physical evidence exerts a significant influence on Patient Satisfaction. The positive regression coefficient suggests that better management of Physical Evidence in the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency, leads to higher levels of Patient Satisfaction.
- People significantly influence Patient Satisfaction in the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency, as indicated by the positive regression coefficient. This implies that improved service delivery by the hospital's staff leads to higher levels of Patient Satisfaction.
- Process demonstrates a significant influence on Patient Satisfaction in the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency. The positive regression coefficient implies that an efficient patient process in the unit contributes to higher levels of Patient Satisfaction.

Based on the calculation results, the effective contribution (EC) of Physical Evidence, People, and Process to patient satisfaction in the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital is noteworthy. Process demonstrates the largest effective contribution at 32.8%, followed by People at 10.2%, and Physical Evidence at 6.75%. Simultaneously, Physical Evidence, People, and Process collectively exhibit a significant influence on Patient Satisfaction in the Haemodialysis Unit of Cicalengka Regional General Hospital, Bandung Regency. The variables of Physical Evidence, People, and Process collectively contribute to 90.5% of Patient Satisfaction, while the remaining 9.5% is influenced by unexamined factors.

5. REFERENCES

- [1] T. Stoev and K. Kanalev, "Motivation of staff in healthcare organizations," *Trakia Journal of Science*, vol. 16, no. Suppl.1, pp. 208–210, 2018, doi: 10.15547/tjs.2018.s.01.041.
- [2] E. L. Silalahi, M. Butarbutar, Z. Sihombing, and N. Ginting, "THE IMPACT OF PRICE, SERVICES, QUALITY OF SERVICES AND PRODUCTS TOWARD PURCHASING DECISION OF CUSTOMERS IN PT. NUSIRA MEDAN," *International Journal of Economics, Bussiness and Accounting Research(IJEBAR)*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 551–565, 2021.
- [3] P. Thi, K. Tuyen, and P. X. Hung, "FACTORS INFLUENCING PATIENTS ' SATISFACTION WITH HEALTHCARE SERVICES – A CASE STUDY OF PUBLIC HOSPITALS IN HUE CITY," *Hue University Journal of Science: Economics and Development*, vol. 130, no. 5, pp. 117–128, 2021, doi: 10.26459/hueunijed.v130i5B.6656.
- [4] B. Othman, W. He, Z. Huang, J. Xi, and T. Ramsey, "The effects on service value and customer retention by integrating after sale service into the traditional marketing mix model of clothing store brands in China," *Environmental Technology and Innovation*, vol. 23, p. 101784, 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.eti.2021.101784.
- [5] M. M. Helms, M. A. Rodrí Guez, L. D. L. Ríos, and W. B. Hargrave, "Entrepreneurial potential in Argentina: A SWOT analysis," *Competitiveness Review*, vol. 21, no. 3, pp. 269–287, 2011, doi: 10.1108/10595421111134859.
- [6] E. Saha and P. K. Ray, "Modelling and analysis of healthcare inventory management systems," *Opsearch*, vol. 56, no. 4, pp. 1179–1198, 2019, doi: 10.1007/s12597-019-00415-x.
- [7] P. Kotler, K. L. Keller, S. H. Ang, C. T. Tan, and S. M. Leong, *Marketing Management: an Asian Perspective*. London: Pearson, 2018.
- [8] N. Monazam Tabrizi, "Relational dimensions, motivation and knowledge-sharing in healthcare: a perspective from relational models theory," *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 2021, doi: 10.1177/00208523211029128.
- [9] D. Díaz de León, O. D. Fragoso, I. Rivera, and G. Rivera, "Cooperatives of mexico: Their social benefits and their contribution to meeting the sustainable development goals," *Social Sciences*, vol. 10, no. 5, 2021, doi: 10.3390/socsci10050149.
- [10] P. Kotler and G. Armstrong, *Principles of Marketing 17th Global Edition*. Pearson Education, 2018.
- [11] P. Kotler and K. L. Keller, *Marketing Management*. London: Pearson, 2019.
- [12] A. M. Mosadeghrad, "Healthcare service quality: Towards a broad definition," *International Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance*, vol. 26, no. 3, pp. 203–219, 2013, doi: 10.1108/09526861311311409.
- [13] A. M. Al-Mhasnah, F. Salleh, A. Afthanorhan, and P. L. Ghazali, "The relationship between services quality and customer satisfaction among Jordanian healthcare sector," *Management Science Letters*, vol. 8, no. 12, pp. 1413–1420, 2018, doi: 10.5267/j.msl.2018.10.003.
- [14] M. Muhardi *et al.*, "The Implementation of Sustainable Manufacturing Practice in Textile Industry: An Indonesian Perspective*," *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, vol. 7, no. 11, pp. 1041–1047, 2020, doi: 10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no11.1041.
- [15] E. Setyowati, "Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan, Harga, Dan Citra Merek Terhadap Loyalitas Pelanggan Dengan Kepuasan Pelanggan Sebagai Variabel Pemediiasi," *Jurnal Manajemen DayaSaing*, vol. 18, no. 2, pp. 102–112, 2017, doi: 10.23917/dayasaing.v18i2.4507.
- [16] L. Ayudia, A. G. P. Siswadi, and F. D. Purba, "Kualitas Hidup Family Caregiver Pasien Orang Dengan Skizofrenia (Ods)," *PHILANTHROPY: Journal of Psychology*, vol. 4, no. 2, p. 128, 2020, doi: 10.26623/philanthropy.v4i2.2777.
- [17] A. A. Abuosi and R. A. Atinga, "Service quality in healthcare institutions: Establishing the gaps for policy action," *International Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance*, vol. 26, no. 5, pp. 481–492, 2013, doi: 10.1108/IJHCQA-12-2011-0077.